

1 Teresa Hayashi Wales SBN 022078  
2 **WELSH LAW GROUP, PLC**  
3 11811 North Tatum Boulevard, Suite P125  
4 Phoenix, AZ 85028  
5 Telephone: (602) 569-0698  
6 Facsimile: (602) 595-0682  
7 [minuteentries@welshlawgroup.com](mailto:minuteentries@welshlawgroup.com)  
8 E-mail: [twales@welshlawgroup.com](mailto:twales@welshlawgroup.com)  
9 Attorneys for Chas Roberts Air Conditioning, Inc.

6 **IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA**  
7  
8 **IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF MARICOPA**

9 GALLERY COMMUNITY  
10 ASSOCIATION, an Arizona non-profit  
11 corporation;

11 Plaintiff,

12 vs.

13 K. HOVNANIAN AT GALLERY, LLC, an  
14 Arizona limited liability company; K.  
15 HOVNANIAN ARIZONA OPERATIONS,  
16 LLC, an Arizona limited liability company;  
17 K. HOVNANIAN DEVELOPMENTS OF  
18 ARIZONA, INC., an Arizona corporation; K.  
19 HOVNANIAN COMPANIES OF  
20 ARIZONA, LLC, an Arizona limited liability  
21 company; JOHN DOES I-X AND JANE  
22 DOES I-X, WHITE CORPORATIONS I-X;  
23 BLACK PARTNERSHIPS I-X; AND GRAY  
24 LIMITED LIABILITY COMPANIES I-X,

21 Defendants.

22  
23 K. HOVNANIAN AT GALLERY, LLC, an  
24 Arizona limited liability company; K.  
25 HOVNANIAN ARIZONA OPERATIONS,  
26 LLC, an Arizona limited liability company; K.  
HOVNANIAN DEVELOPMENTS OF  
ARIZONA, INC., an Arizona corporation; K.  
HOVNANIAN COMPANIES OF ARIZONA,  
LLC, an Arizona limited liability company;

Case No. CV2020-008714

**STIPULATION FOR DISMISSAL  
WITH PREJUDICE AS TO  
THIRD PARTY DEFENDANT  
CHAS ROBERTS AIR  
CONDITIONING, INC. ONLY**

(Assigned to the Hon. Katherine  
Cooper)

1 Third-Party Plaintiffs

2 v.

3 CHAS ROBERTS AIR CONDITIONING,  
4 INC., an Arizona corporation; DESERT  
5 VISTA, INC., an Arizona corporation;  
6 GOTHIC LANDSCAPING, INC., a California  
7 corporation; HOME BUILDERS SITE  
8 SERVICES OF ARIZONA, LLC, an Arizona  
9 limited liability company; LEBLANC  
10 BUILDING CO., INC., an Arizona  
11 corporation; LIBERTY CONSTRUCTORS,  
12 LLC, an Arizona limited liability company,  
13 dba LIBERTY ARIZONA; RENCO LLC, an  
14 Arizona limited liability company, dba  
15 RENCO ROOFING; R/S SERVICE &  
16 SUPPLY, INC., an Arizona corporation;  
17 SARGON MASONRY CONSTRUCTION,  
18 LLC, an Arizona limited liability company;  
19 and DOES 1-50.

20 Third-Party Defendants.

21 The parties undersigned, hereby stipulate and agree that in the above-captioned  
22 matter, all claims brought by Third Party Plaintiffs K. Hovnanian at Gallery, LLC; K.  
23 Hovnanian Arizona Operations, LLC; K. Hovnanian Developments of Arizona, Inc.; and  
24 K. Hovnanian Companies of Arizona, LLC's as against Third Party Defendant Chas  
25 Roberts Air Conditioning, Inc., **only**, may be dismissed with prejudice, with each party to  
26 bear their own costs and attorneys' fees.

DATED this 6<sup>th</sup> day of April 2022.

WELSH LAW GROUP, PLC

By /s/Teresa Hayashi Wales

Teresa Hayashi Wales, Esq.

Attorney for Third Party Defendant Chas  
Roberts Air Conditioning, Inc.

LORBER GREENFIELD POLITO

By /s/Amy M. Wilkens [with permission]

Amy M. Wilkens, Esq.

Attorney for Third Party Plaintiffs

ORIGINAL filed and a copy of the foregoing e-mailed April 6, 2022 to:

Dennis I. Wilenchik, Esq.  
Matthew V. Moosbrugger, Esq.  
Wilenchik & Bartness, P.C.  
2810 North Third Street  
Phoenix, AZ 85004  
[admin@wb-law.com](mailto:admin@wb-law.com)

Amy Wilkens, Esq.  
Lorber, Greenfield & Polito, LLP  
3930 E. Ray Road, Suite 260  
Phoenix, AZ 85044  
[hdavies@lorberlaw.com](mailto:hdavies@lorberlaw.com)  
[awilkens@lorberlaw.com](mailto:awilkens@lorberlaw.com)  
Attorneys for Defendants/Third-Party Plaintiffs

Copy of foregoing e-mailed this same date to the Service List:

REPRESENTED PARTY	ATTORNEY NAME & ADDRESS	TELEPHONE FAX AND EMAIL
Plaintiffs	Craig S. Nuss, Esq. Penny J. Manship, Esq. Burg, Simpson, Eldredge, Hersh & Jardine, P.C. 8310 South Valley Highway, Suite 720 Englewood, CO 80112	<a href="mailto:cnuss@burgsimpson.com">cnuss@burgsimpson.com</a> <a href="mailto:pmanship@burgsimpson.com">pmanship@burgsimpson.com</a>
Defendants/Third-Party Plaintiffs	Dennis I. Wilenchik, Esq. Matthew V. Moosbrugger, Esq. Barbara Stansil, Esq. Wilenchik & Bartness, P.C. 2810 North Third Street	<a href="mailto:diw@wb-law.com">diw@wb-law.com</a> <a href="mailto:barbaras@wb-law.com">barbaras@wb-law.com</a> <a href="mailto:admin@wb-law.com">admin@wb-law.com</a>

**WELSH LAW GROUP, PLC**

1		Phoenix, AZ 85004	
2		Amy Wilkens, Esq. Lorber, Greenfield & Polito, LLP 3920 E. Ray Road, Suite 260 Phoenix, AZ 85044	<a href="mailto:hdavies@lorberlaw.com">hdavies@lorberlaw.com</a> <a href="mailto:awilkens@lorberlaw.com">awilkens@lorberlaw.com</a> <a href="mailto:erico@lorberlaw.com">erico@lorberlaw.com</a>
3			
4	Chas Roberts Air Conditioning	Teresa Hayashi Wales, Esq. Welsh Law Group, PLC 11811 N. Tatum Blvd., Suite P125 Phoenix, AZ 85028	<a href="mailto:twales@welshlawgroup.com">twales@welshlawgroup.com</a> <a href="mailto:agurka@welshlawgroup.com">agurka@welshlawgroup.com</a>
5			
6	Gothic Landscaping	C. Cole Crabtree, Esq. Amanda R. Hough, Esq. Jaburg & Wilk, P.C. 3200 N. Central Ave., 20 <sup>th</sup> floor Phoenix, AZ 85012	<a href="mailto:ccc@jaburgwilk.com">ccc@jaburgwilk.com</a> <a href="mailto:aah@jaburgwilk.com">aah@jaburgwilk.com</a>
7			
8	LeBlanc Building Co.	Michael A. Ludwig, Esq. Stephen F. Best, Esq. Jones, Skelton & Hochuli, PLC 40 North Central Ave., Suite 2700 Phoenix, AZ 85004	<a href="mailto:mludwig@jshfirm.com">Mludwig@jshfirm.com</a> <a href="mailto:sbest@jshfirm.com">sbest@jshfirm.com</a> <a href="mailto:minuteentries@jshfirm.com">minuteentries@jshfirm.com</a>
9			
10	Liberty Constructors	Tom Shorall, Esq. Jason Boblick, Esq. Shorall McGoldrick Brinkman 1232 East Missouri Avenue Phoenix, AZ 85014	<a href="mailto:tomshorall@smbattorneys.com">tomshorall@smbattorneys.com</a> <a href="mailto:jasonboblick@smbattorneys.com">jasonboblick@smbattorneys.com</a>
11			
12	Renco Roofing and Desert Vista, Inc.	Shannon Huff, Esq. Mohamad H. Tokko, Esq. Rai Duer Huff, P.C. 3033 N. Central Avenue, Suite 500 Phoenix, AZ 85012	<a href="mailto:SHuff@rdhfirm.com">SHuff@rdhfirm.com</a> <a href="mailto:MTokko@rdhfirm.com">MTokko@rdhfirm.com</a> <a href="mailto:TOBrien@rdhfirm.com">TOBrien@rdhfirm.com</a>
13			
14	Sargon Masonry Construction	Leonard T. Fink, Esq. David S. Schopick, Esq. Springel & Fink LLP 3033 N. Central Ave., Suite 500 Phoenix, AZ 85012	<a href="mailto:lfink@springelfink.com">lfink@springelfink.com</a> <a href="mailto:dschopick@springelfink.com">dschopick@springelfink.com</a>
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			

/s/Amy Gurka